



**ALL INDIA
BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED
OFFICERS' ASSOCIATION
CENTRAL HEAD QUARTERS**

37, Laxmibainagar, New Delhi – 110023

President
J.K.MISHRA
Mobile: 9868159951

Finance Secretary
V.GURUMURTHY
Mobile: 9444979555

General Secretary
V.P.ARYA
Mobile: 9868210478

No. AIBSNLOA/CHQ/2009/39

Dated 6th August 2009

To

Shri Kuldeep Goyal,
Chairman & Managing Director,
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited,
New Delhi 110 001.

Sub: Recruitment Rules of BSNL Management Services - A replica of the ITS/IP&AFS and other Group A Services RRs of DOT with additional draconian provisions bring total disappointment and frustrations in the Executives absorbed/recruited at the Group B level in BSNL

Sir,

We regret to convey to you that after going through the "Recruitment Rules of BSNL Management Services" issued vide BSNL No. 400-106/2007-Pers I dated 14.07.2009, we are totally frustrated and demoralized. We never imagined that BSNL Management will let us down so badly and deviate completely from the basic theme of the Promotional Policy that was offered to us through the Terms and Conditions of Service for absorption [vide Annexure IV of BSNL No. BSNL/11/SR-2001 dated 02.09.2003]. The Promotion Policy that was offered to us makes it clear that it would be time bound upgradation to the next higher grades up to JAG Selection Grade and thereafter post based promotions beyond the JAG Selection Grade. Thus the Policy that was to be followed for promotion in BSNL was "*cluster-based*" promotion policy as available in all other CPSEs. But the BSNL Management has introduced a promotion policy through the Recruitment Rules of BSNL Management Services which is totally post based at all levels. Thus what was offered to us in the terms and conditions for absorption has been totally sidelined.

2. On going through these Rules it looks like that these are the replica of those Recruitment Rules for Group A Officers as available in the Department of Telecommunication. BSNL seems to have taken all the care to ensure that the Group A Officers of DOT after their absorption continue to enjoy the same benefits in BSNL which they enjoyed in DOT in respect of grant of Non-functional Selection Grade in JAG level after 13th year of service, promotion to General Manager Grade on completion of 17th year of service and Senior General Manager Grade after 25th year of service etc. But no consideration has been given to end the sufferings and injustice

meted out to the promotee source Executives. This is just not the end. These Recruitment Rules also contain certain provisions which make the RRs of BSNL MS even worse than the RRs/promotion policy available in Department of Telecommunications. We would like to highlight some of those provisions and other deficiencies as follows:-

(1) Mode of Recruitment: It has been stated in Para 2.7(a) that “*Campus Selection*” would be one of the modes of Recruitment. We strongly believe that this would invite trouble for Management as well. We are confident that Management may not be able to withstand the pressure to select candidates recommended and backed by powerful lobbies through this route. The Executives who are already in service would also be seriously affected as “*Campus Selection*” could be at any level/stage. This provision needs to be withdrawn.

(2) Lateral entry: It has been stated in Para 4.1 of the Rules that BSNL Management would resort to “*lateral entry*” at the level higher than that of *Management Trainees*. This provision is not acceptable. The Executives at the level of JTOs/SDEs/DEs equivalents are already reeling under the pressure of unprecedented stagnation. Thus lateral entry at the level of AGMs/DEs/CAOs equivalent or DGMs etc, shall further shrink the opportunity of their career advancement. This provision, therefore, needs to be either withdrawn or applied only at the level of CGM/Principal GM Level/Grade and above.

(3) Seniority of Group A Officers recruited after 1.10.2000 and absorbed from ITS Group A and IP&TAFS Group A: It has been provided in second part of Para 6.2 under “Initial constitution” that “*The Group A Officers recruited after 1.10.2000 and absorbed from Indian Telecommunication Service (ITS) Group A and Indian P&T Accounts and Finance Service (IP&TAFS) Group A will also form part of their respective streams in BSNLMS and these entire absorbed Group A Officers shall rank en-block senior in their respective grade, to any executive or Management Trainee and higher levels of respective streams, recruited or promoted by BSNL in any grade*”. We fail to understand how the Group A Officers recruited by DOT **after** 1.10.2000 can get absorption in BSNL since the date of absorption is 1.10.2000 and therefore those who were not borne in service on that crucial date cannot get absorbed. Thus, this provision is redundant and confusing.

(4) Pre-revised IDA Pay Scale for Joint General Manager and equivalent (SG JAG) downgraded from the one approved by DOT: The pre-revised IDA pay scale against CDA pay scale of Rs 14300-400-18300 has been shown as Rs 17500-400-22300 at Para 5.1 (sl iv.b), Para 5.2 (sl iv.b) and 5.3 (sl iii.b) of BSNLMS. But DOT, the administrative Ministry, has already approved the pre-revised IDA pay scale of Rs 18500-450-23900 against the CDA pay scale of Rs 14300-400-18300 and offered the same to the Group A Officers while inviting option for absorption in BSNL/MTNL at Para 6.3 (Sl No 3 of the Table showing corresponding IDA pay scales for BSNL) of Annexure-II in the General Terms and Conditions for Exercising option for absorption vide No. A-11013/1/2005-Admn.II/Absorption Cell (ITS/TS/TFS) dated 26.8.2008. How could this pay scale be downgraded by BSNL without similar downgradation by DOT in their Terms and Conditions for Exercising option for absorption?

(5) Consideration of promotion of seniors: It has been stated in Para 12 of the RRs that in case where the juniors have completed their qualifying / eligibility service are being considered for promotions, their seniors would also be considered *provided they are not short of qualifying / eligibility service by more than one year* ...We are of the view that this condition of one year's service is unjust and unethical. Non-completion of qualifying / eligibility service by the seniors happens mainly on administrative grounds like delayed DPC, sealed cover procedure, non-availability of ACRs, non-inclusion of names in the list of eligible candidates for promotion etc, which are not the faults on the part of the candidates. Thus, they should not be punished for purely administrative lapses. Further, the DOP&T Rules also do not have any restriction regarding number of years of service for the seniors to be considered for promotion along with their juniors. Therefore, this condition that the seniors are not short of the requisite qualifying / eligibility service by more than one year should be withdrawn.

(6) Inbuilt provision for continuation of promotion on adhoc basis: It is unfortunate that the Recruitment Rules for BSNL MS not only speaks for promotion on adhoc basis, but also has been framed in a such a way so that ad hoc promotion continues for ever. In Schedule 1-A (against Sl No. 1), it has been provided that the posts in DE/CAO/AGM level will be filled up by promotion from SDE/AO level Executives only upto 50% of the posts. The directly recruited MTs, will also be promoted to the level/grade of DE/CAO/AGM to the *extent of vacancies decided by BSNL every year subject to maximum of 50% of the posts*. This provision will leave thousands of posts in DE/CAO/AGM level to remain vacant over the years and ad hoc promotion will have to be continued to fill up these posts. We understand the compulsion on the part of the Management for ensuring limited recruitment of Management Trainees every year. It cannot go for indiscriminate recruitment of MTs, since it would cause acute stagnation to them also. As in the case of JTS Officers in DOT, BSNL Management also likes to ensure that at least those joining BSNL MS through Management Trainee route do not stagnate at any stage. But on this account, there is no justification in keeping over thousands of posts at DE/CAO/AGM level vacant and take recourse to ad hoc promotion and thereby deny a little breathing space for the SDE/AO level Executives. In order to avoid large scale ad hoc promotions, 75% of the posts in DE/CAO/AGM level could have been ear marked for the SDE/AO level Executives and rest 25% of the posts could have been set apart for promotion of the MTs. A look into the age profile of the existing SDE/AO level Executives will confirm that even with this enhanced quota their vertical movement remains very much restricted.

(7) Civil / Electrical /Architecture Wing Executives discriminated: In Note 2 below Schedule 1-A, while making a provision for future promotion to DE/CAO/AGM level posts only for the Degree holders for Telecom Operations and Graduate or Equivalent in respect of Finance of BSNLMS, a dispensation has been given to the extent that the *existing incumbents holding the posts of Executives on regular basis on the date of notification of these RRs shall continue to be eligible for promotion to the grade of DE/AGM/CAO. Same dispensation is also available in Note 2 below Schedule 1-C for Telecom Factory Organization.* **But no such dispensation has been given to the existing incumbents holding the posts of Executives for promotion to the grade of Assistant General Manager/EE/Arch as could be seen in Note 2 below schedule 1-B. It is pertinent to mention here that many of these Diploma holder Executives, being eligible as per**

the DOT RR, are already promoted to the AGM/EE level/grade in Electrical and Civil Wing. Thus there is no reason to deny the same benefit to the existing incumbents holding the posts of Executives in Civil and Electrical Wing as has been extended to the similar categories of Executives of other streams in Schedule 1-A and Schedule 1-C.

(8) Total blocking of career progression of non-degree holder Executives at the level of JTO/SDE equivalents in Telecom Operation Service, Civil/Electrical/ Architectural and Telecom Factory Wing and also non-graduates in other services: It is surprising to note that the Recruitment Rules for BSNLMS has totally banned further promotion of the non-degree holder Executives at the level of JTOs who would join this grade on regular basis after 14.07.2009 i.e. after the notification of the Recruitment Rules for BSNL MS. There are many M.Sc/B.Sc (Electronics), MCA, Diploma Holders etc, among them. The TTAs would also be the worst sufferers on this count. In respect of other disciplines, similar is the situation. How could Management deny them promotion to AGM/DE equivalent level posts at this stage? When recruited in the non-Executive feeder cadres for promotion to JTO equivalent posts, they were never told that their career advancement would stop at the stage of SDE equivalent only. This is certainly a *disincentive* to the non-Executive cadres. We believe that by this act, Management is *inviting a new problem*. There could be a demand for reservation of posts at AGM equivalent level posts and above from the non-Executives or even separate channel for promotion, if this provision in the RR of BSNLMS is not withdrawn. Once some one is promoted to the level of SDE equivalent, he should be allowed for further promotion to the AGM/DE equivalent posts on his own merit.

(9) PSU Promotion Policy totally violated: These Recruitment Rules for BSNL MS starts from the level/grade of AGMs/DEs/CAO equivalent Executives. There are already separate Recruitment Rules for the Executives at the level/grade of JTOs/JAOs equivalent, SDE/AOs equivalent and even Management Trainees. In the PSUs, apart from following cluster based promotion policy, there is only one comprehensive recruitment/promotion rule for all below Board Level Executives. But it is only the BSNL, though now a CPSE, which is trying to keep the DOT Rules and legacy in place and create divisions within the Executives. This is certainly unfortunate and speaks of the wrong mind set of the Management.


(10) Uniformity and equal opportunity to the Executives of all disciplines in the promotion policy given up: In the Promotion Policy that was annexed to the Terms and Conditions for absorption of Group B Officers of DOT in BSNL, it was categorically assured that the promotion policy would be uniform for all the disciplines. But the RRs of BSNL MS completely violate the same. MT route for recruitment has been prescribed for Telecom Operations Service and Telecom Finance Service alone. Further, availability of posts in the hierarchy is not proportionate to the strength in the feeder cadres which will cause imbalance in career advancement from one stream to other. Stagnation will therefore remain a serious cause of concern. Cluster based promotion policy as followed by all CPSEs and also offered in the Terms and Conditions for absorption of Group B level Officers would have been the best solution to such issues.

(11) HR Stream neglected: In all Organizations, HR is considered as an important stream and efforts are always made to strengthen this stream by HR integration and selecting proper personnel to manage the functions etc. But the RRs of BSNL MS has totally neglected this stream. There is a strong need to give a proper place to HR in BSNL by spelling out its structure, mode of manning the positions etc

3. In view of the above, we shall request you to kindly withdraw the above BSNL MS Recruitment Rules and examine the points raised by us in this letter for corrective action and to render justice to the Executives so that they do not feel agitated, demoralized and de-motivated. **We shall also request to kindly give us an opportunity to discuss the matter at your earliest.**

With kind regards,

Yours sincerely,



(V.P.Arya)
General Secretary

Copy to:

1. Shri A Raja,
Minister of Communications &IT.
2. Shri Gurudas Kamat,
Minister of State for Communications & IT.
3. Shri Siddhartha Behura,
Secretary, DOT.
4. Shri R Bandopadhyay,
Secretary, DPE.
5. Shri Gopal Das,
Director (HRD), BSNL.
6. Shri S R Kapoor,
Executive Director (Finance), BSNL.
7. Shri.R.K.Mishra,
General Manager (Pers), BSNL.